



<https://review.e-siber.org/SIJDB> ✉ siberpublisher.info@gmail.com ☎ +62 812-1046-7572

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.38035/sijdb.v1i2>

Received: 02 October 2023, Revised: 09 October 2023, Publish: 17 October 2023

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

A Systematic Literature Review Women Leadership in Police

Ida Oetari Poernamasasi

Universitas Bhayangkara Jakarta Raya, Indonesia, email: 202230152002@mhs.ubharajaya.ac.id

Corresponding Author: 202230152002@mhs.ubharajaya.ac.id

Abstract: A Systematic Literature Review on women's leadership in Policing aims to provide insight into how women in leadership in several countries in the world. The issue of women in the police becomes important along with the concept of gender equality in police organizations which are dominated by men. Women must try to get roles in the police, including becoming leaders, despite the various challenges they face. This research uses secondary data based on the results of a study conducted in the 2009-2023 period. The method used is to examine articles/journals published via Google Scholar, Emerald and Semantic Scholar. The results of the SLR show that from 2009 - 2023 women are still struggling to become leaders in the police because there is still discrimination, obstacles and gender prejudice in their careers. Career promotion still has subjective criteria that justify that male leadership candidates are ideal in the police. This finding is due to the police organizational culture being "masculine" even though female leaders are recognized as having a unique, feminist leadership style, being more collaborative and communicative compared to their male colleagues.

Keyword: *Women Leader, Police, Career*

INTRODUCTION

Women are an integral part of our society (Punama, 2017). The existence of women has guaranteed stability, progress and long-term development of a country (Gran, 2019). Along with civilizational and social changes, there has been a shift in the role of women in society from being expected to be a housewife, taking care of the family, focusing on children and their happiness (Maison, Sekscinska, & Trzcinska, 2016) to working outside the home, seeking leadership (Adasi, Ansah, & Baffoe, 2014) and a respected position in society.

Globally, women's participation at senior management levels is increasing gradually. This can be seen in research conducted by Grant Thornton (2020) where the proportion of women increased to 29 percent in 2019 and 2020, making it the highest figure ever recorded.

However, although the proportion of women in senior manager positions has increased, there are often fewer women working in higher positions in companies. Leaks in the female leadership pipeline were discovered by more than 1,100 organizations worldwide, according to a Mercer report (2020). The International Labor Organization's (ILO) claim that women are overrepresented in supporting roles is supported by research which reveals that there are only 23% of female executives, 29% of female senior managers and 37% of female managers

The role of women in police organizations throughout the world has long been discussed and various studies have been carried out. This is quite reasonable considering that women in the police are a minority, there is even a stereotype that the police is a masculine organization. The gender issue that was raised in the discussion questioned how women could change the face of the police, especially in the modern police era which does not prioritize a hard approach but rather prioritizes a soft approach in providing services and protection to the community.

In this systematic literature review, we will discuss women's leadership in police organizations, the challenges and how to overcome them. The study was taken from several researchers who discussed women's leadership in the police from various parts of the world so that conclusions can be drawn.

METHOD

Research Object

The method used uses the PRISMA framework, namely Preferred Reporting items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. This literature review was taken from previous research journals that have been published in Emerald, Semantic scholar, and Google Scholar, using the keywords: women's leadership and the police. The article retrieval period is 2009-2023 (15 years). Search results based on the keywords above found 17,100 international journals, but the closest match to the keywords was found in 14 previous articles. The next treatment was screened based on year, publisher and country of origin.

Research Questions

Research questions are asked to focus data analysis according to the research topic. The research questions are as follows: 1) Q1: What is the aim of conducting research on women's leadership in the police in several countries?; 2) Q2: What are the results of research on women's leadership in the police?.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

The inclusion criteria for this research are articles that discuss women's leadership and the challenges they face. The object of the institution is the police organization. The articles taken are international journals. The time range is 2009-2023. Exclusion criteria are female leadership who are not included in the police sector.

The distribution of article publishers can be seen in the table below:

Table 1. Journal Publisher Data on Women's Leadership in the Police

No	Publisher	Year	Total
1.	Emerald	2023	1
2.	University of Victoria desertasi	2023	1
3	Sage Journal	2023	1
4.	Emerald	2023	3
5.	Europian Journal of Criminology	2022	1
6.	International Journal of research in business and social	2022	1
7.	International Journal of Contemporary Applied Researches	2022	1
8.	Routledge Taylor and Francis online Policing and Society	2021	1
9.	Routledge Taylor and Francis online Women and criminal justice	2021	1
10.	Leadership, Organisation and Administrative Sciences German Police University Germany	2018	1
11	Journal Advancing women in leadership	2017	1
12.	Routledge Taylor and Francis online Criminal Justice Studies	2009	1

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The objects of research on women's leadership in the police are female police and male police and workers in the gender sector as well as students. The research locations are Germany, Sweden, USA, Canada, Tanzania, South Africa, Ghana, Australia, New Zealand and Argentina. The distribution of countries shows that the issue of women's leadership in the police is discussed in both developed and developing countries. These countries represent all continents, indicating that the issue of women's leadership in the police is a global issue.

Research Methods in the 15 journals obtained used qualitative methods with purposive samples of female police officers and male police officers. Quantitative methods are also used in order to obtain data. The table below shows how researchers obtained data.

Table 2. Data of Research Technique

No	Research Technique	TOTAL
1	In depth interview	9
2	Questioner and interview	1
No	Data Research Technique	TOTAL
3	Experimental a two-by-two vignette	1
4	Focus Group Discussion (FGD)	1
5	Longitudinal study and FGD, Survey	1
6	Simple random sampling	1

From the table above, information is obtained that there are 9 journals using data collection techniques by means of interviews or in-depth interviews with respondents who have been determined by researchers according to the criteria. Meanwhile, other researchers obtained data by dividing questionnaires and then conducting interviews. There are also researchers who conduct FGDs, and what is interesting is that they conduct longitudinal studies with interviews and FGDs and then carry out surveys after a certain period of time. Some of the respondents were male police and some were female police respondents. Apart from that, researchers determined that the respondents were female leaders and former female leaders as pioneers

The Result and analysing Q1

Table 3. The Country Origin and the Aim of Research

No	Title	Countries	The research aims
1	Women, Leadership and Policing: Negotiating and Navigating Gendered Experiences	British Colombia, Canada	To explore the lived experiences of 21 women police officers in southern British Columbia and their gendered experiences from recruitment through promotion to positions of leadership
2	Leadership Characteristics Through The Lens of Trans locational Positionality Framework: Trailblazing Women in Policing	USA	to explore the experiences of trailblazing women leaders in US police organizations as viewed through the lens of trans locational positionality framework (TPF)
3	Women police leaders in Europe: A tale of prejudice and patronage	7 Europe countries	To identify informal and formal barriers for women police to their advancement in European police organizations.
4	Leadership development framework for women in policing in South Africa: Overcoming leadership barriers	South Afrika	<i>Examines the challenges faced by South African women in attaining leadership roles in policing. Furthermore, the study develops a leadership development framework for ensuring the advancement of women in policing..</i>
5	Self-Confidence of Police Women in Leadership Positions towards Career	Tanzania	The study focused on how self-confidence affects women participation in leadership.

No	Title	Countries	The research aims
	Progress in Moshi Municipal Police		position towards career progression in Moshi municipality, Tanzania
6	Women-led police stations: reimagining the policing of gender violence in the twenty-first century	Argentina	Team looked for inspiration to reimagine the policing of gender violence in the twenty-first century from the victim-centred women-led police stations that emerged in Argentina
7	Women in Policing and Legitimacy: A Vignette-Based Study of Symbolic Representation	Missouri USA	to examine the effects of women's symbolic representation in sexual assault units and the arrest rate for interpersonal violence cases on individuals' perceptions of police legitimacy, support for leadership, and willingness to engage in bystander intervention behaviours.
8	Female Leaders in a Male Organization: An Empirical Analysis of Leader Prototypicality, Power and Gender in the German Police	Germany	explores the impact of gender on the perception of leader prototypicality and power in the police. In a pre-study,
9	The Leadership Discourse Amongst Female Police Leaders in Sweden	Sweden	To analyze and construct the leadership discourse articulated by female leaders within the Swedish Police
10	Women Leadership in Metropolitan Police Departments in South Africa	South Afrika	To examine women leadership in Metropolitan Police Departments in South Africa
11	Women in policing: changing the organizational culture by adopting a feminist perspective on leadership	UK	to identify aspects of classical leadership that may be of particular value within the police service.
12	Women in uniform breaking the glass ceiling? An exploratory study of female officers in leadership positions in Ghana's Security Services	Ghana	to examine how women become leaders in the Security Services in Ghana and the challenges they face in the discharge of their responsibilities.
13	They expect me to be caring": the challenges of claiming an androgynous leadership approach	New Zealand	to explore the experience of performing androgynous leadership approaches by New Zealand women leaders within the context of everyday conflict situations.
14	Building career capital in policing in Australia through women's leadership programmes	Australia	This paper highlights how career capital is accrued through three ways of knowing in a women's leadership programme (WLP) in an Australian State Police Department. A shift in focus to building capability rather than addressing gaps in participants' abilities was enhanced through the unique use of sponsors and positive psychology interventions

This research on women's leadership does not only focus on policewomen as respondents, but also involves male police, students and workers in the gender sector so that there is a perspective of thinking about women's leadership by male police as work partners. Based on the 14 studies in table 3.1.1 above, they were conducted in the police of developed countries and developing countries, namely South Africa, Ghana, Tanzania, England, Germany, Sweden, Canada, the United States, Argentina, Australia and New Zealand. The country distribution of research on leadership issues in the police is still a concern for researchers.

The objectives of research on women's leadership can be known to: a) Examining why female leaders are in a male "industry", how women lead, the challenges faced by female leaders, the influence of women's representation in handling cases of violence against women

and children; b) Identifying aspects of classic leadership in the police, informal barriers to women in leadership; c) Exploring the androgynous leadership experiences of women in the police; d) Constructing how women lead in the police; e) Comparing female and male police officers' perceptions of leader prototypes and displayed power.

The Result and Analyzing Q2

Answering question 2 (Q2), namely: The results of research on women's leadership in the police can be seen from the table below:

Table 4. The Result of Research

No	Title	The Research Result
1	Women, Leadership and Policing: Negotiating and Navigating Gendered Experiences	Although many are in leadership positions, promotion and acceptance remain difficult. Women who choose to have children are considered to be less committed to their career because the ladder upward has no rungs for a more committed homelife. Women Leader were bringing to policing such as being more collaborative and communicative than their male colleagues. Many women leader experienced having to prove their value and worth on a continual basis and transforming themselves to fit into the normative policing culture.
2	Leadership Characteristics Through The Lens of Translocational Positionality Framework: Trailblazing Women in Policing	Women police leaders' behaviors and leadership characteristics were fluid based on the context and circumstances of the situation The trailblazing participants were unique, and their leadership strategies were different from their colleagues because they were willing to create their own path to leadership opportunities.
3	Women police leaders in Europe: A tale of prejudice and patronage	Women police leaders report high levels of gender discrimination, obstruction and prejudice over the course of their careers. there are a number of subjective and informal criteria of 'acceptability' that shape women's experiences of promotion and that informal patronage is a strong basis from which strategic appointments are made within European police systems. There are the ways in which informal aspects of career progression function alongside formal promotion criteria to preserve men as the 'ideal' candidates for police leadership positions, resulting in a preference for other men and the exclusion of women.
4	Leadership development framework for women in policing in South Africa: Overcoming leadership barriers	There is a lack of strategic policy in place that can ensure the advancement of women as leaders in the policing field in South Africa. The overall outlook of male police officers is affected by stereotypical assumptions about females' strengths and abilities.
5	Self-Confidence of Police Women in Leadership Positions towards Career Progress in Moshi Municipal Police	Police women have integrity in leadership position with mean value which is average to neutral response. In order to improve police women toward leadership career progression police force must build self-confidence to police women through training, special course and workshop
6	Women-led police stations: reimagining the policing of gender violence in the twenty-first century	We argue that if staffed by appropriately trained teams to work from both gender and culturally sensitive perspectives, women-led victim friendly police stations could side-step some of the unintended consequences of criminalisation, pathing the way for reimagining the policing of gender violence.
7	Women in Policing and Legitimacy: A Vignette-Based Study of Symbolic Representation	A higher level of women's representation was associated with more police legitimacy and greater support for the leader when the agency had a low arrest rate. Women's representation in policing strengthens the support for the police in gendered areas when the agency is underperforming
8	Female Leaders in a Male Organisation: An Empirical Analysis of	the main effect of women trusting and endorsing leaders more than their male colleagues is driven by a significant gender difference in the attitudes towards non-prototypical and highly power displaying

No	Title	The Research Result
	Leader Prototypicality, Power and Gender in the German Police	leaders. Prototypical and low power leaders were trusted and endorsed equally by both genders
9	The Leadership Discourse Amongst Female Police Leaders in Sweden	The female leadership discourse 5 thame: The leadership style of good leaders is generally a transformational one A transactional approach to leadership is visible in relation to crisis situation Extensive experience as police officer is of importance Leaders need support in different ways experiences of being a “token” female in a male dominated organization is common. The challenge is feminine leadership style exist.
10	Women Leadership in Metropolitan Police Departments in South Africa	Women needed to gain more knowledge in order to be on top, improve themselves in the career, bring change, and provide a safe and supportive environment for nurturing confidence, acquiring new skills as well as be educated. Barriers to appointment of women in senior leadership position. There are policies and legislation that are currently being implemented to ensure entry of women into fields that have always been viewed as male-dominated
11	Women in policing: changing the organizational culture by adopting a feminist	the ethical parameters of policing there by an organizational culture that has a hyper-masculine social structure to define their norms and that structure is often the catalyst for adverse experiences for female police officers. The police culture is often misogynist but the role of women is important in policing therefore the influence of feminist ethics and descriptors may offer an insight into changing an existing organizational culture as well as providing a feminist perspective on leadership.
12	Women in uniform breaking the glass ceiling? An exploratory study of female officers in leadership positions in Ghana’s Security Services	The study revealed that women deliberately positioned themselves to be considered for leadership placements in their male-dominated professions. The study’s findings also suggest that although both men and women are considered equal in the service, women were faced with challenges in their daily experiences as leaders due to their gender. The gender barriers created a strenuous situation for women to rise to top leadership placements in the Security Services
13	They expect me to be caring”: the challenges of claiming an androgynous leadership approach	Participants described taking a flexible, balanced, androgynous leadership approach to managing conflict situations. While the expectations to be “empathetic”, “sympathetic”, “gentle”, “nurturing” and “caring” resonated with the participants preferred approach, they remained firm that if conflict persisted, they would “cross the line” and adopt stereotypically masculine behaviours to resolve the situation. However, participants describe that when perceived to be crossing the line from feminine to masculine approaches, they experienced significant backlash. This demonstrates the tensions between the approaches women leaders would like to take in managing conflict and the experiences of doing so within a prescriptively gendered organisational context.
14	Building career capital in policing in Australia through women's leadership programmes	<i>Originality/value</i> The authors' study extends extant knowledge in seven key ways related to WLPs: (1) reaffirms the benefits for police, (2) developing or enhancing career capital, (3) accruing women’s career capital in policing, (4) pedagogical benefits for WLPs, (5) articulating outcomes of developing career capital, (6) the uniqueness of allocating sponsors and (7) extending empirical studies demonstrating synergies within the intelligent career framework

Based on the table above regarding the results of research on women's leadership in the Police, it is clear that each researcher still gets answers to the research questions as depicted in the table above. It can be said that in order to reach a leadership position in the police, women

are faced with challenges both from themselves, namely the need to improve themselves, their self-confidence, experience and they are faced with stereotypes as women who work in men's environments and in social environments. In terms of the HR development system, there are still ways to create requirements so that ideal male leadership in the police is displayed. However, there are already many female leaders in the police.

CONCLUSION

The results of research analysis that has been carried out, than conclusions can be drawn based on the results of the Systematic Literature Review or SLR as follows:

- 1) That the aim of the research is to identify aspects of classic leadership in the police, informal barriers for women in leadership, examine women's leadership among men and its challenges and explore the experiences of women leaders in the police.
- 2) The results of the research include that in order to reach a leadership position in the police, women are faced with challenges both from themselves, stereotypes as women who work in a male environment and social perceptions about female leadership, even though there is already a lot of female leadership.

REFERENCE

- Activities, B. f. (2019). Women in Business and Management: The business case for change. *International Labour Organization*, 149.
- Adasi, G. S., Ansah, C. A., & Baffoe, R. S. (2014). The Role and Position of Women Ancient Society to Modern Society in India. *International Knowledge Sharing Platform Journal and Books*, Volume 4, No. 22.
- Ali, Muhammad, & Chin-Hong. (2017). Transformational leadership, organizational commitment and innovative success (Issue 88134).
- Anthony, M., & Soontiens, W. (2019). Reality checks for career women: An interpretivist paradigm. *Journal of Management and Organization*. <https://doi.org/10.1017/jmo.2019.42>
- Angehrn, A., Fletcher, A. J., & Carleton, N. (2021). "Suck It Up, Buttercup": Understanding and Overcoming Gender Disparities in Policing. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 76-78.
- Archbold, C., & Moses Schultz, D. (2008). Making rank. The lingering effects of tokenism on female police officers' promotion aspirations. *Police Quarterly*, 11(4), 50-73.
- Avolio, B., Walumbwa, F., & Weber, T. (2009). Leadership: current theories, research, and future directions. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 60, 421-449.
- Benson, L. (2018). Permanency of Leader Self-Confidence Development: a Longitudinal Comparative Analysis. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 906-931. <https://doi.org/10.20319/pijss.2018.42.906931>
- Blythe, J., Bryant-Lukosius, D., Carter, N., Dicenso, A., & Neville, A. (2014). The use of triangulation in qualitative research. *National Center for Biotechnology Information*, 41(5):545-7.
- Brandl, S. G., & Strohshine, M. S. (2011). Race, Gender, and Tokenism in Policing: An Empirical Elaboration. *SAGE Journals*, Volume 14, Issue 4.
- Burey, J.-A., & Tulshyan. (2021, February 11). *Stop Telling Women They Have Imposter Syndrome*. Retrieved from Harvard Business Review: <https://hbr.org/2021/02/stop-telling-women-they-have-imposter-syndrome>
- Debebe, G. (2009). Transformational learning in women's leadership development training. *Advancing Women in Leadership Journal*, 29(7). Retrieved [2009-10-28] from http://advancingwomen.com/awl/awl_wordpress/.
- Frey, B. B. (2018). Document Analysis. *SAGE Research Methods*, Volume 1-4.
- Gran, M. (2019, March 8). *The Global Role of Women- Caretakers, conscience, farmers, educators and entrepreneurs*. Retrieved from Global Volunteers: <https://globalvolunteers.org/global-role-of-women/>

- Langton, L. (2016). Women in Law Enforcement. *US Department of Justice, Bureau of Justice Statistics*, 50-62.
- Maison, D., Sekscinska, K., & Trzcinska, A. (2016, NA NA). *The Influence of different Social Roles Activation on Women's Financial and Consumer Choices*. Retrieved from Frontiers in Psychology: https://www.bing.com/search?q=traditional+role+of+women+research&qs=n&form=QBRE&msbsrank=0_1__0&sp=-1&pq=traditional+role+of+women+research&sc=1-34&sk=&cvid=1146FE5050A448E6AFE3CA4E3E3E9CDE
- Manz, D. o., & Thomas, E. W. (2017, NA NA). *Convenience Sampling*. Retrieved from Science Direct: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/topics/computer-science/convenience-sampling>
- Mercer. (2020, NA NA). *Let's Get Real about Equality: When Women Thrive 2020 Global Report*. Retrieved from Mercer: <https://www.mercer.com/our-thinking/next-generation-global-research-when-women-thrive-2020.html>
- Ontario Human Rights Commission. (2021, NA NA). *Racism and racial discrimination: Systemic discrimination (fact sheet)*. Retrieved from Ontario Human Rights Commission: <http://www.ohrc.on.ca/en/racism-and-racial-discrimination-systemic-discrimination-fact-sheet>
- Pflichten, G. R. (1919, NA NA). *The Feminist Perspective*. Retrieved from Introduction to sociology: <https://courses.lumenlearning.com/cochise-sociology-os/chapter/the-feminist-perspective/>
- Pickering, L. (2012, NA NA). *Encyclopedia of Applied Ethics (Second Edition)*. Retrieved from Science Direct: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/topics/social-sciences/feminist-theory>
- Punam, S. (2017). The Role and Position of Women Ancient Society to Modern Society in India. *Research Gate*, 127-141.
- Smart HR. (2019, March 25). *Five Major Challenges Women Face in teh Workplace*. Retrieved from Smart HR: <https://www.smarthrinc.com/five-major-challenges-for-women-in-the-workplace/>
- Thornton, G. (2020, March 2). *Women in Business report 2020*. Retrieved from Grant Thornton: <https://www.grantthornton.global/en/insights/women-in-business-2020/women-in-business-2020-report/>
- US Bureau of Labor Statistics. (2021, April NA). *Women in the labor force: a databook*. Retrieved from Official Webiste of US Goevrnment: <https://www.bls.gov/opub/reports/womens-databook/2020/home.htm>
- Women and Policing. (2021, NA NA). *Women in Law Enforcement*. Retrieved from Women and Policing: <https://nickotthwomenandpolicing.weebly.com/statistics.html>
- Women in Law Enforcement. (2021, NA NA). *Statistics*. Retrieved from Women in Law Enforcement: <https://socwomeninlawenforcement.weebly.com/statistics.html>
- Women in Law Enforcement. (NA, NA NA). *Hiatory: Women in Law Enforcement*. Retrieved from Women in Law Enforcement: <https://womeninlawenforcement.weebly.com/history.html>
- Zamabs, J. (2018, January 8). *15 Issues Women Still Face in the Workplace*. Retrieved from Career Addict: <https://www.careeraddict.com/women-workplace>